

D1.8

Guidelines for Societal Acceptance and Ethical considerations – Third Release

Sara Perry¹, Maria Economou², Hilary Young²

Reviewed by:

Akrivi Katifori (ATHENA), Emilia Sosnowska (UGLA)

Abstract

This document offers an update to the ethical and privacy principles and procedures applied by the EMOTIVE project during our third and final year of activities.

Official Submission Date: 31/10/2019

Actual Submission Date: 31/10/2019

Dissemination Level: PU

Version: 1.0

Partner	Estimated Effort (in PMs)
¹ YORK	1
UGLA	0.5
ATHENA	0.1



TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....	3
2	RISKS OF VIRTUAL REALITY EQUIPMENT	5
3	EMOTIVE FINAL DEMONSTRATION EVENT.....	6
	ANNEX 1: RISKS OF USING VIRTUAL REALITY TEMPLATE	7
	ANNEX 2: EMOTIVE DEMONSTRATION EVENT CONSENT FORM (GDPR-COMPLIANT, ADULT).....	8
	ANNEX 3: EMOTIVE DEMONSTRATION EVENT CONSENT FORM (GDPR-COMPLIANT, MINOR).....	10
	ANNEX 4: EXAMPLE OF ETHICS APPROVAL FROM YORK’S ARTS AND HUMANITIES ETHICS COMMITTEE	12

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AHEC: Arts and Humanities Ethics Committee, University of York

GDPR: General Data Protection Regulation

UGLA: University of Glasgow

YORK: University of York



1 Executive Summary

The purpose of this deliverable is to offer an update to D1.7 (the second release of EMOTIVE's ethics and privacy principles and procedures), describing the ethics requirements and the data protection procedures that have been applied by EMOTIVE during its final year of research. Our research has entailed work on: 1) end-users' onsite experiences; 2) end-users' online experiences; 3) end users' authoring experiences; and 4) user-centred workshops (with cultural heritage and creative industries professionals) and evaluation of the tools and aforementioned experiences (with end-users). End-users include both visitors of cultural sites (i.e. consumers of experiences) and authors.

Most procedures for data management and informed consent linked to the evaluation of experiences and design workshops are similar in their general principles, and only minor details are adapted to each specific case (e.g. researcher/institution involved, environment, type of evaluation strategy, etc.). Between November 2018 and October 2019, these procedures have been successfully implemented at the following events:

- Final Summative testing of EMOTIVE Hunterian Onsite "Ebutius's Dilemma" experience with Albert Sierra, Glasgow, UK (January 23, 2019).
- Formative evaluation of the Web of Knowledge design approach, using the Hunterian Virtual Museum ("Ebutius's Dilemma" online experience) to collect user questions at ATHENA, Athens, Greece (January 24, 2019).
- Final Summative testing of EMOTIVE Hunterian Virtual "Ebutius's Dilemma" experience with UGLA MSc Museum Studies Students, Glasgow, UK (February 6, 2019).
- Prototype testing of "Views on Verecunda's Life" with Glasgow School of Art MSc Heritage Visualisation students, Glasgow, UK (March 21, 2019).
- Demo-ing "Ebutius's Dilemma" Hunterian onsite experience with 3D Design: Final Year students from Creative Industries Faculty, Glasgow City College, Glasgow, UK (March 22, 2019).
- Multiple summative evaluation sessions for "Ebutius's Online" with secondary school teachers and secondary school pupils from Helensburgh (March through August, 2019).
- Testing "Ebutius's Dilemma" virtual off-site experience and showcasing "Ebutius's Dilemma" onsite experience at co-organised Historic Environment Scotland, University of Edinburgh and University of Glasgow event "Engaging with Digital Cultural Heritage" with c. 50 delegates from cultural heritage, creative industries and academia held at The Engine Shed, Stirling, UK (April 4, 2019).
- Formative evaluation of "Views on Verecunda's Life" prototype with Information Studies and Museum Studies staff and PhD students, Glasgow, UK (April 26, 2019).
- Formative evaluation of "Views on Verecunda's Life" prototype with Cypriot primary school teachers and advisors taking part in Erasmus+ Museum Education training, Glasgow, UK (May 2, 2019).
- Prototype testing of EMOTIVE Family and Group Dialogues with 3D Moulds with University of York Master's students, King's Manor, York, UK (May 16, 2019).
- Prototype testing of EMOTIVE Family and Group Dialogues with 3D Moulds with EMOTIVE team members and external volunteers, King's Manor, York, UK (May 30, 2019).
- Second formative evaluation of the Visitor-Led Tours Experience with volunteers and York Minster staff at York Minster, York, UK (May 31, 2019).
- First summative evaluation of "Views on Verecunda's Life" with Historic Environment Scotland, Glasgow, UK (June 10, 2019).

- First formative evaluation of EMOTIVE Family and Group Dialogues with 3D Moulds with adults and young people at the University of York's Family Fringe Festival, York, UK (June 8, 2019).
- Second formative evaluation of EMOTIVE Family and Group Dialogues with 3D Moulds with adults and young people at the Council for British Archaeology's Festival of Archaeology, York, UK (July 13, 2019).
- Onsite final evaluation of EMOTIVE Family and Group Dialogues with 3D Moulds with local youth at Çatalhöyük, Turkey (August 1-8, 2019).
- Onsite final evaluation with visitors, local residents and site staff of the Turkish and English versions of the Çatalhöyük Collaborative Experience, Çatalhöyük, Turkey (August 1-8, 2019).
- Formative evaluation of EMOTIVE VR Experience with adult volunteers in Nice, France, and UK (August 8, 2019).
- Formative evaluation of EMOTIVE audio-enhanced models with adult volunteers at King's Manor, York, UK (August 28, 2019).
- Second summative evaluation of "Views on Verecunda's Life" at the EMOTIVE demo test-run event with staff and students from the University of Glasgow, Glasgow, UK (September 3, 2019).
- Final summative evaluation of "Views on Verecunda's Life" Lower Saxony delegation, Glasgow, UK (September 4, 2019).
- Formative evaluation of the EMOTIVE How-To Guide for building bots of conviction with international PhD researchers enrolled on the Nordic Dialogues with the Past Workshop, Rome, Italy (September 16-20, 2019).
- Formative evaluation of the Web of Knowledge prototype, using the Hunterian Virtual Museum ("Ebutius's Dilemma" online experience) at ATHENA, Athens, Greece (September 19 and October 21 and 22, 2019)
- Final evaluation of EMOTIVE Hunterian Onsite "Views on Verecunda's Life" Smithsonian Digital Cultural Heritage Lab research showcase, Glasgow, UK (October 8, 2019).
- Summative evaluation of EMOTIVE VR Experience with adult volunteers in Athens and York (October 16-17, 2019).
- Summative evaluation of EMOTIVE VR Experience with adult volunteers in Athens, Greece (October 23, 2019).
- Formative evaluation of EMOTIVE audio-enhanced models with the Young Archaeologists' Club of Sheffield, Sheffield, UK (October 19, 2019).

Additionally, we take account of the management of user data collected during EMOTIVE experiences, which requires the automatic acquisition and/or the manual introduction of the user's personal data, both for personalization and/or for the successful development of the activity. These data management and protection procedures are described in D1.6 and, as they relate to the introduction of the General Data Protection Regulation, in D1.7. As well, our goals and methodology, general policies and procedures are described in detail in D1.6.

Therefore, the present deliverable focuses *only* on changes to our approach necessitated in the past year of activities because of work with virtual reality devices and the unique conditions associated with our final demonstration event on 30 October 2019. We offer here:

- Details on the creation of a Risks of Using Virtual Reality consent form for participants who engage with our virtual reality experiences
- Details on modifications to our generic project consent form for adults and minors involved in the EMOTIVE Project final demonstration event on 30 October 2019



2 Risks of Virtual Reality Equipment

Some of our EMOTIVE experiences deploy virtual reality (VR) technologies, which necessitate the wearing and operation of VR headsets. Generally, the use of a VR headset has been associated with known risks, including emotional or mental distress, physical discomfort, and the potential for physical harm or injury. While our partner institutions have different regulations around user engagements with VR, the University of York was advised to author a specific consent form concerning VR risks, which would then be appended to our generic GDPR-compliant project consent forms (see D1.7). YORK provided some guidance on the content of the risk-specific form, which we have crafted to explicitly identify possible effects on users, including the potential for them to become disoriented or nauseous, accidentally fall, trip over a cable, come into contact with a nearby person or object, feel anxious or nervous, trigger epileptic seizures, fainting, or severe dizziness, even in people who have no history of such conditions, and otherwise aggravate serious pre-existing medical conditions or psychiatric conditions, and negatively impact individuals who are pregnant or elderly (see ANNEX 1).

Approval of the VR Risks consent form from the relevant institutional Ethics Committees was sought, and email or written confirmation from those committees was returned (e.g., see ANNEX 4) prior to instigating data collection. Alongside our GDPR-compliant information sheets and general consent forms, and in some cases image releases (see 1.7 for copies), the VR Risks consent form was circulated to participants. The originals of these signed and completed documents are securely stored at their respective institutions.

It is important to note that participants in our VR experiences are also always overseen by at least one facilitator, a member of the EMOTIVE Project who is responsible for ensuring safe use of the VR equipment. After completing the VR risk form, participants are introduced to their facilitator and verbal explanation of the technology—how to remove it if necessary, and how to call for help if required—is provided.

3 EMOTIVE Final Demonstration Event

EMOTIVE is showcasing its tools, methods and experiences at a final demonstration event on 30 October 2019 at the Hunterian Museum in Glasgow. This event is unique for the project because:

- it is being held in a public venue where both invited guests and general visitors might engage with our outputs
- it will allow participants to test all of our experiences, including those which may carry risks because of the use of certain equipment (see above regarding VR risks)
- it will be subject to media coverage and participants may be captured in photos, video and audio recordings taken both by EMOTIVE Project members and by external media representatives
- it may attract both young people and adult users to experiences that have been designed for specific age groups (e.g., our experiences that use VR, for which the risks are much higher for individuals under 14 years old)

Accordingly, we have developed an event-specific GDPR-compliant consent and image release form for adults (ANNEX 2) and minors (ANNEX 3). All people who enter the Hunterian Museum on 30 October 2019 during our demonstration event will be asked to read and sign these forms, then provided with a name tag. If they choose to opt out of any aspect of the event (e.g., image-taking, VR use, etc.), colour-coded stickers will be added to their name tags for easy identification. Visitors to the museum who do not have a name tag will be asked to return to the front desk should they wish to participate in any of our experiences.

ANNEX 1: RISKS OF USING VIRTUAL REALITY TEMPLATE

This workshop will involve wearing and operating the HTC Vive, a virtual reality (VR) headset. Generally, the use of a VR headset has been associated with known risks, including emotional or mental distress, physical discomfort, and the potential for physical harm or injury. The following information will explain these risks.

Wearing a VR headset detaches one's senses from the physical world, both visually and auditorily, making it possible for a user to:

- become disoriented or nauseous
- accidentally fall
- trip over a cable
- come into contact with a nearby person or object
- feel anxious or nervous

Additionally, using a VR headset may present a risk for individuals with serious pre-existing medical conditions, psychiatric conditions, or who are pregnant or elderly. Use of VR headsets can trigger epileptic seizures, fainting, or severe dizziness, even in people who have no history of such conditions.

You may withdraw from the experience at any time. To do so, you may remove the VR headset or ask for assistance. All minors must have a guardian's signature on a consent form and be accompanied by an adult at all times.

Please read and tick the boxes below to indicate your agreement:

- I will follow instructions on safe equipment handling.
- I will ask clarifying questions if any instructions are unclear.
- I will communicate any potentially negative reactions to workshop leaders.

Have you ever used a VR headset before?

- Yes No

If you have any questions or concerns, please contact Kristen O'Connor at [REDACTED] or the Department of Archaeology, University of York, King's Manor, York, UK, YO17EP.

ANNEX 2: EMOTIVE DEMONSTRATION EVENT CONSENT FORM (GDPR-COMPLIANT, ADULT)

NAME: _____

EMAIL ADDRESS: _____

SIGNATURE: _____

DATE: _____

A. Please read and check the boxes below regarding your **PARTICIPATION** to indicate your agreement:

- I have read and understood the project Information Sheet and have had the opportunity to ask questions about the research.
- I understand that my participation is voluntary and I may withdraw at any time without consequence.
- I agree to take part in EMOTIVE and for data collected by EMOTIVE team members and/or produced by me during EMOTIVE activities to be used to inform the project's findings and publicity. I give consent for my data to be used in research, presentations, publications and other media and publicity arising from EMOTIVE, both print and online. **[If you do NOT tick this option, please return this form to an EMOTIVE staff member. You are welcome to tour the museum, but you will not be able to participate in EMOTIVE's experiences.]**
- I understand my data will be retained in secure storage for use in future academic research and publicity.

B. If you have agreed to participate, please select **ONE** of the following **ANONYMITY** options:

- Option 1:* The materials collected during this event may be used in future academic research and publicity, and I understand that I might be recognizable.
- Option 2:* The materials collected during this event may be used in future academic research and publicity, however I prefer that my identity is altered/obscured.

C. Please read the following **IMAGE RELEASE** information, then check yes or no:

I agree to the use of my image(s) for research, presentations, promotional literature produced by the EMOTIVE Project, including leaflets, posters, newsletters and other display material, on EMOTIVE's website and other social media sites, including Facebook, Twitter, Instagram and YouTube, and in any publicity material about EMOTIVE sent to the news media. I understand that websites and other online media can be seen throughout the world, and not just in the United Kingdom where UK law applies.

- Yes**, I agree for my image to be used.
- No**, I do not agree for my image to be used, but I still wish to participate in the event.

D. Risks of Virtual Reality - ADULT

Several stations at this event involve wearing and operating a virtual reality (VR) headset. The use of VR equipment is associated with known risks, including physical discomfort, emotional or mental distress, and the potential for physical harm or injury.

Wearing a VR headset detaches one's senses from the physical world, both visually and auditorily, making it possible for a user to:

- become disoriented or nauseous
- accidentally fall
- trip over a cable
- come into contact with a nearby person or object
- feel anxious or nervous

Further, VR may present a risk for individuals with serious pre-existing medical conditions, psychiatric conditions, or who are pregnant or elderly. Use of VR can trigger epileptic seizures, fainting, or severe dizziness, even for those with no history of such conditions.

Please read and check the boxes below to indicate your agreement about the VR EXPERIENCES:

I am 14 years or older.

I will follow instructions on safe equipment handling and ask clarifying questions if instructions are unclear.

I will communicate any negative reactions to workshop leaders.

I understand that I may withdraw from the experience at any time by removing the VR headset or asking for assistance.

NAME: _____

SIGNATURE: _____



ANNEX 3: EMOTIVE DEMONSTRATION EVENT CONSENT FORM (GDPR-COMPLIANT, MINOR)

PARENT/GUARDIAN NAME: _____

PARENT/GUARDIAN EMAIL ADDRESS: _____

PARENT/GUARDIAN SIGNATURE: _____

DATE: _____

MINOR PARTICIPANT NAME(S):

A. Please read and check the boxes below regarding your PARTICIPATION to indicate your agreement:

I have explained the project Information Sheet to the above-named participants and acknowledge that they understand the research and have had the opportunity to ask questions about it.

The above-named participants understand that their participation in EMOTIVE is voluntary and they may withdraw at any time without consequence.

I give permission for all above-named individuals to participate, and for data collected by EMOTIVE team members and/or produced by participants during EMOTIVE activities to be used to inform the project's findings and publicity. I give consent for the above-named participants' data to be used in research, presentations, publications and other media or publicity. **[If you do NOT tick this option, please return this form to an EMOTIVE staff member. You are welcome to tour the museum, but you will not be able to participate in EMOTIVE's experiences.]**

I understand that the above-named participants' data will be retained in secure storage for use in future academic research and publicity.

B. If you have agreed to participate, please select ONE of the following ANONYMITY options:

Option 1: The materials collected during this event may be used in future academic research and publicity, and I understand that the above-named participants might be recognizable.

Option 2: The materials collected during this event may be used in future academic research and publicity, however I require that the above-named participants' identities are altered/obscured.

C. Please read the following IMAGE RELEASE information, then check yes or no:

I agree to the use of my image(s), and those of the above-identified minor(s) under my care, for research, presentations, promotional literature produced by the EMOTIVE Project, which includes leaflets, posters, newsletters and other materials, on EMOTIVE's website and other social media, including Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, and YouTube, and in publicity material about EMOTIVE sent to news media. I understand that websites and other online media can be seen throughout the world, not just in the United Kingdom where UK law applies.

Yes, I agree for my image to be used.

No, I do not agree for the images of the above-named individuals to be used, but we still wish to participate in the event.



D. Risks of Virtual Reality - MINOR

Several stations at this event involves wearing and operating a virtual reality (VR) headset. The use of VR equipment is associated with known risks, including physical discomfort, emotional or mental distress, and the potential for physical harm or injury.

Wearing a VR headset detaches one's senses from the physical world, both visually and auditorily, making it possible for a user to:

- become disoriented or nauseous
- accidentally fall
- trip over a cable
- come into contact with a nearby person or object
- feel anxious or nervous

Further, VR may present a risk for individuals with serious pre-existing medical conditions, psychiatric conditions, or who are pregnant or elderly. Use of VR can trigger epileptic seizures, fainting, or severe dizziness, even for those with no history of such conditions.

Please read and check the boxes below to indicate your agreement about the VR EXPERIENCES:

- All minor participants named on this form are 14 years or older.
- I will ensure that the minor(s) under my care will be accompanied by an adult while in VR.
- I will ensure that the minor participant(s) follows instructions on safe equipment handling and asks clarifying questions if instructions are unclear.
- I will ensure that the minor participant(s) communicates any negative reactions to workshop leaders.
- All participants understand that they may withdraw from the experience at any time by removing the VR headset or asking for assistance.

MINOR PARTICIPANT NAME(S):

PARENT/GUARDIAN NAME: _____

PARENT/GUARDIAN SIGNATURE: _____

If you have any questions or concerns, please contact EMOTIVE's Ethics Manager, Dr Sara Perry at sara.perry@york.ac.uk or the Department of Archaeology, University of York, King's Manor, York, UK, YO17EP.



ANNEX 4: EXAMPLE OF ETHICS APPROVAL FROM YORK'S ARTS AND HUMANITIES ETHICS COMMITTEE

For research on the EMOTIVE VR Experience by YORK MSc student in Summer 2019.



Ethics Application

2 messages



7 May 2019 at 18:34



To confirm, with my ethic hat on, I am satisfied that [redacted] ethics application has been through our review process and is approved.

Good luck with the research,
James.

[Dr. James Stuart Taylor](#)
([ORCID ID](#))
Associate Lecturer Archaeology
Departmental [Ethics Representative](#)

Co-Director of Studies:
[MSc Digital Heritage & MSc Digital Archaeology](#)

[Office Hours/Supervision Slots](#)

Recent articles:
[Theorising the Digital: A Call to Action for the Archaeological Community](#)
[The Rise of the Machine': the impact of digital tablet recording in the field at Çatalhöyük](#)

[Department of Archaeology](#)



Room K/199 · King's Manor · [Exhibition Square](#) · York YO1 7EP
Tel: (+44) 1904 32 3271
e-mail: james.s.taylor@york.ac.uk

